#### PROGRESA

Well targeted program

> Incidence of illness down by 23%

School enrollment up by 0.7 years

Anthropometric (weight) measures improved

### What works in community based

<u>3</u> 16

 Community bas interventions h impact on mater mortality;

inter No impact of community support and advocacy, family members; Clean deliveries had a 29% reduction in mortality.

 Significant imp neo-natal mortal Community based interventions reduced neo-natal mortality by 27%



### Impact Evaluation: A Science *and* an Art

Dr. Jo (Jyotsna) Puri Deputy Executive Director, 3ie Head of Evaluation, <u>www.3ieimpact.org</u>

Pakistan Institute of Development Economics, Islamabad, 22<sup>nd</sup> May, 2013

## What is common to all these evaluations?





What is an impact evaluation?

The holy grail statement:

A cash transfer program *caused* a 7% *increase* in the *income* of the *included* population.

= the ( we can see this compa absence of the interve =  $Y_t(1) - Y_t(0)$  cator with the intervention would have been in the But we can't see this So we use a comparison group

### What do we need to measure impact?



Providing cash transfers to the disadvantaged and low income groups



	Before	After
Project (treatment)		92
comparison		

The majority of evaluations have just this information ... which means we can say absolutely nothing about impact

### Before versus after single difference compariso Before versus after = 92 − 40 = 52

	Before	After
Project (treatment)	40	92
comparison		

"the cash transfer project has led to a higher incomes in a number of villages"

This 'before versus after' approach is outcome monitoring.

Outcome monitoring has its place, but it is not impact evaluation

#### Post-treatment comparison comparison Single difference = 92 - 84 = 8



	Before	After
Project (treatment)		92
comparison		84

But we don't know if they were similar before... though there are ways of doing this (statistical matching = quasi-experimental approaches)

### Double difference = (92-40)-(84-26) = 52-58 = -6



	Before	After
Project (treatment)	40	92
comparison	26	84

Conclusion: Longitudinal (panel) data, with a comparison group, allow for the strongest impact evaluation design (though still need matching).

SO WE NEED BASELINE DATA FROM PROJECT AND COMPARISON AREAS

### What do we need to measure impact?





### So in fact







### Paying for Performance: China's battle against Anaemia



To assess the impact of

information financial anaemia a. rural China

72 *randomly* selected schools. Approximately 4000 fourth and fifth graders.

Four arms: three treatments and one control:

- -Information only about anemia
- Information and a subsidy
- Information, subsidy and incentive
- Control group

### Paying for Performance: China's battle against Anaemia



 To assess the impact of information, subsidies and financial incentives to reduce

anaemia 2

rural C

Hemoglobin levels increased much more in due to subsidies and incentives;
Test scores higher due to subsidies and even greater due to incentives.

### What do you need?



Efficacy: Does it work in laboratory conditions?

Would it have happened anyway?

Did the program cause the change?

If the program caused the effect, how *much* was the effect? Are there other ways, that are cheaper to get the same impact?

Theory of change **Counterfactual** Mixed methods Outcome variables Internal validity: power, sample size, spill overs, External validity: Heterogeneity, representativeness, context



International Initiative for Impact Evaluation

3ie

Improving the supply side and the demand side of evidence based developments

3

2010-13

Improving lives th a strategy for 3ie gh Impact Evaluation

### 3ie sub grant windows

- Primary studies
  - Open Windows
  - Thematic windows
  - Policy windows
- Systematic reviews

International Initiative for Impact Evaluation Synthetic Review 008



Behaviour Change Interventions to Prevent HIV among Women Living in Low and Middle Income Countries

Sandra McCoy, R. Abigail Kangwende and Nancy S. Padian December 2009



3 10



## So, what about policy influence?

### We take sophisticated techniques

3



### Which make nice academic studies





### Which get published in top journals



#### The American Economic Review

ARTICLES

A REPORT OF	
	A diversity of the Consult Content
	Transformed Control and Street Controls of State
Ind it is not the	Last & Lincoln & Lincoln & Strength & Streng
and the second second	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •
	Name and Address of Address and Address an
August	Barris Factoriani da Comunita Productional Propositional Data
	Des palacies (L. editor). Wign pris (L. Million (Horse-strains) in Reality (a), American Discretional of Transmist (Editor).
	Fallent States Measured and 10 Second Amount Am
-110-00-0	Man (no work) States on Sufer for show Streams, Spring
	and in other property large and in a color-
Tel Science and	Things on because the second
(1-1-1), Harris - 1	Concession and Advancements and the Owner Descent
	Testing and the second state of the second
And in case of	And a strength of the local Address of the second strength on the second strength of the se
A Distance and I	Annual of a lower of a summarized to be summarized to be a summarized

#### THE QUARTERLY JOURNAL OF ECONOMICS

FOUNDED 1886

Volume CXXI February 2006 Issue 1

ARTICLES	
MARK DUGGAN AND FIONA M. SCOTT MORTON	
The Distortionary Effects of Government Procurement	-
Evidence from Medicaid Prescription Drug Purchasing	1
Offshoring in a Knowledge Economy	31
DAVID MARMAROS AND BRUCE SACERDOTE	
How Do Friendships Form?	79
BOTOND KÖSZEGI	
Emotional Agency	121
DANIEL BERGSTRESSER, MIHIR DESAL, AND JOSHUA RAUH	
Investment Decisions	- 157
JONATHAN REUTER AND ERIC ZITZEWITZ	
Do Ads Influence Editors? Advertising and Bias in the	
Financial Media	197
GIAN LUCA CLEMENTI AND HUGO A. HOPENHAYN A Theory of Financing Constraints and Firm Dynamics	990
Reverse Streversion and Justin Working	
Bargaining in the Shadow of the Law: Divorce Laws and	
Family Distress	267
MARTHA J. BAILEY	
More Power to the Pill: The Impact of Contraceptive Freedom on Women's Life Cycle Labor Sundy	280
LEE G. BRANSTETTER, RAVMOND FISMAN, AND C. FRITZ FOLEY	-
Do Stronger Intellectual Property Rights Increase International	
Technology Transfer? Empirical Evidence from U.S.	
Firm-Level Panel Data	321
PUBLISHED FOR HARVARD UNIV	ERSITY
BY THE MIT PRESS, CAMBRIDGE, MASSACH	IUSETTS
QJE 121(1) 1-349 (2006)	NT. 101
TARK TRANSPORT	1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1

#### Journal of Development Effectiveness



### Which is meant to lead to..



### **Funding Windows**





#### **Open Windows**

#### Thematic Windows

#### **Policy Windows**

### Open Windows



### Thematic Window

3



### Policy Window



### **Policy Window**



- Policy window grants for governments

- Technical advice for *agencies* 



#### Preparation grants include:

Sri Lanka, Philippines, Fiji, Ecuador, South Africa, NEPAD, Uganda etc.



## What is in it for governments and implementing agencies?

- Increase evaluation capacity (training and quality assurance).
- Evaluation of programs that are innovative and will be scaled up.
  - Financial support
  - Technical support
- Systematic reviews of evidence
- Policy impact clinics
- Commitment to evaluation evidence.
- Others –bursaries, support.



Figure 1. Odds ratios and 95% confidence intervals for all offenses by study.

### GoBiFO

- 2006-9 community directed post-conflict reconstruction intervention in rural Sierra Leone.
- Block grants of \$4667
- Outcomes: delive marginalized gr action capacity

Results: Mixed. Material benefits: Yes. Collective action: No

 236 eligible villages; pan randomized. <sup>3</sup>ie

ONE AY TO

Behaviour Change Interventions to Prevent HIV among Women Living in Low and Middle Income Countries Sandra McCoy, R. Abigail Kangwende and Nancy S. Padian

OMS AVING



**International Initiative for Impact Evaluation** Synthetic Review 005



**Community-Based Intervention Packages for Preventing Maternal Morbidity** and Mortality and Improving Neonatal Outcomes

Zohra S Lassi, Batool A Haider, and Zulfigar A Bhutta March 2010

Water, sanitation and hygiene interventions to combat childhood diarrhoea in developing countries Hugh Waddington, Birte Snilstveit, Howerd White, and Lorna Fewtrell

AIR-FRESHENER

August 2009

# www.3ieimpact.org

December 2009

3 10