



Department of Development Studies
Discussion Paper 1

*Saidpur Village: A Case Study of Post-Development Critique
and Impact of Commercialisation on Local Community*

Muhammad Rahim Shah

November 2015

PAKISTAN INSTITUTE OF DEVELOPMENT ECONOMICS

CONTENTS

| | |
|--|----|
| INTRODUCTION | 3 |
| Post World War-II Era: Development as Modernisation | 4 |
| Post-Development theory: Critique of Modernisation | 5 |
| Culture and Development | 7 |
| LITERATURE REVIEW | 8 |
| RESEARCH QUESTION | 10 |
| METHODOLOGY AND METHODS | 10 |
| Sampling | 11 |
| FINDINGS | 11 |
| Once home to <i>Ghakhars</i> : Opulent agrarian tribe | 11 |
| ' <i>Ghakhar</i> ' Culture: Amalgamation of Islamic values and Eastern agrarian traditions | 12 |
| Changing scenario | 12 |
| Parameters of Analysis: Deconstruction of <i>Ghakhar's</i> culture | 13 |
| Analysis: Extinction of old culture and changing values | 13 |
| Changing means of livelihoods | 14 |
| Changing role of females | 15 |
| Easily detachment from roots | 16 |
| Fueling aggressive and hostile attitude | 16 |
| Income inequality | 17 |
| Adopting to new culture and perception of tourism as means to economic growth | 17 |
| CONCLUSION | 18 |
| RECOMMENDATIONS AND LIMITATIONS OF PAPER | 19 |
| ACRONYMS | 21 |
| GLOSSARY | 21 |
| REFERENCES | 22 |

INTRODUCTION

The development discourse that has been prevalent in the post-World War-II era has actually cascaded down from the economic and political thoughts of colonisation era. The theoretical approaches that have encompassed the discourse are solely driven by the concept of economic growth and aimed at modernisation of the economies of global South in the light of the European ideas and experiences. This new era of highly Eurocentric development approaches has been criticized by the Post-Development Theorists, commonly referred to as the anthropologists of development, for wide-scale social engineering without regards for the indigenous culture, knowledge and values. The discourse has been condemned for being wrong answer to the plight of the poor of South and attempting to resolve issues with policies and institutions that worsen the situation of underdevelopment and poverty instead of making positive impact.

Saidpur Village in Islamabad, Pakistan, is a very relevant case study of the development as modernisation and economic growth, and its impact on the socio-economic pattern of the indigenous community and its culture. The governments of Pakistan's quest for creating new investment avenues for economic growth and modernisation have not been fruitful, both socially and economically, for the actual inhabitants of the Saidpur, but, the elite and political class has benefitted from the unique exotic location to attract tourists and expanding their business. This paper tries to examine the impact of the tourism and commercialisation ventures of the government on the indigenous cultural norms and values and also try to find out through the native perspective if the tourism and commercialisation have translated some economic and social benefits to the natives.

The paper consists of three parts; the first part would be dedicated to review the literature on the post-World War-II development discourse and critique by the post-development theory. The second part will consist of the anthropological survey of the Saidpur Village carried out to collect primary data using anthropological research methods and then analyse the data in the light of the critique of modernisation by post-development theory. The last part will encompass of the conclusion of the study and recommendations.

Post World War-II Era: Development as Modernisation

The concept of development has been an indispensable ingredient of the human society and its quest for the improved standard of life. The genealogy of development thinking in contemporary history is from the colonisation of Asian, African and Latin American countries by the scientifically, institutionally and militarily advanced European countries. During this whole period development was associated with possession of colonies and wherein harnessing the cheap natural and human resources of the colonies for the economic growth and industrialisation of the home country.

In post-World War-II era a new paradigm of the development emerged. The newly independent countries, in pursuit of political and economic legitimation, started looking up to the Western experiences and adopting the Western model of development. The dependence of newly independent countries on the technological and institutional advancement of the former colonial masters, and replicating their experiences in their countries across the globe underpinned the concept of what McMicahel (2000) calls the 'Development Projects'. These developmental projects, according to McMicahel (2000, 75), were aimed at: a) universalising the Western living standards, rationality and scientific progress; b) providing framework of development as economic growth; c) international flow of military and economic aid from developed countries to developing countries; d) formulating strategies favoring industrialisation; e) flourishing agro-industrialisation. This post-World War-II development thinking is commonly known as the 'Theory of Modernisation' and the era is referred to as the era of modernisation.

The Modernisation theory asserted that the root cause of the underdevelopment in traditional economies was the irrational resource allocation. It further asserted that development and economic growth can only occur if the resource allocation is rationalised and the hindrances and roadblocks, like culture and social institutions, are eliminated (Islam, 2009, 25). The theory identifies different stages of modernisation, commonly known as the Rostow's stages of modernisation, which the theory implies that all countries have to pass through. The stages were: 1) the traditional society, 2) preconditions for take-off, 3) take-off, 4) the drive to maturity, and 5) the age of high mass consumption (Rostow, 1960).

The development as modernisation theory also assumes that with economic growth and industrialisation, the income inequality in the society is expected to further worsen. This hypothesis was forwarded by Kuznet (1955) in his famous Kuznet curve theory. Kuznet believed that the inequality which results from industrialisation and modernisation inherently entails its own cause of doom. He believed that the individuals who have accumulated wealth would reinvest their wealth in the economy and the fruits of modernisation and industrialisation would 'trickle down' to the poor people and hence inequality would decrease eventually.

Post-Development Theory: Critique of Modernisation

The theories of modernisation remained centrepiece of development thinking and practise for more than three decades in the post-World War-II era. During this era the aspired results of development were not achieved and the hypothesis of the redistribution through trickling down of the accumulated wealth of rich was apparently proved wrong. The fruits of the industrialisation and the modernisation had provided new business and investment opportunities for the rich people and the income inequality and poverty had further increased.

Post-Development theory came up in the 1980s as the radical critique of the post-World War-II development approaches and as response to the failure of the development discourse to meet the aspired results. The works of the prominent post-development scholars, influenced mainly by Marxist and Foucaultian ideas, like; Escobar A., Rahnema M., Sachs W., Ferguson J., Esteva G., Latouche S., Rist G. and many others have not only criticised the failure of the developmental process to answer the needs of the beneficiaries but also have shown reservations over how the development discourse has come into being, how it has identified the issues of underdeveloped countries, and how it has prescribed remedies to those issues.

Development per se has majorly been criticised by post-development theorists for being Ethnocentric (Eurocentric) and universalisation of Western values and notion of development. Escobar (1997, 497) argues that development in post-World War-II era has been characterized as 'industrialisation, high degree of urbanisation, technification of

agriculture, widespread adoption of values and principle of modernity, including particular form of order, rationality and individual orientation.

One of the major arguments that post-development theorists present is the use of development discourse as a means of neo-imperialism by the advanced Western countries. Development as modernisation has been used by Western countries to create new markets in the South and human development and preservation of culture has been overlooked. In fact, the critique of Fergusan (1990) and Escobar (1995), as quoted by Islam (2009, 26), sees development discourse as nothing more than an apparatus of surveillance and control of the Southern economies by the Western industrialised countries.

The Western experience and models of development fail to understand the intricate of social and cultural aspects of the underdeveloped world and hence fail to understand the issues that prevail and the reason behind them. Majid Rahnema analyses this concept in following way: 'who says that development did not fail because governments, institutions and people implemented it poorly, but rather because it is the wrong answer to [its target populations] needs and aspirations' (Rahnema, 1997, 379).

One major theoretical and methodological flaw that associated with the modernisation theory is that it looks for the observable and quantifiable economic aspects of the society. For example, the measurement for development is Gross Domestic Products (GDP) and per-capita income, which are easy to calculate and observe but in the essence they represent only the average fluctuation in the income of the individuals and household. The non-observable and non-quantifiable aspects like social bonding, social capital, culture, rituals, norms and values are not taken into account. But, on the contrary these non-tangible and no-observable aspects are so deep rooted and integral parts of the society that they define the way of life and pattern of thinking of the community.

The development discourse in the post-World War-II era was solely focussed on economic growth and the developmental projects were designed to help countries to catch up with the economic growth of Western countries or what these countries attribute development to. Sachs (1992, 1) declares this unidirectional and Western oriented discourse as 'a ruin in the intellectual landscape', and believes that 'it is not the failure of development which has to be feared, but its success' (Sachs 1992, 3). Escobar (1995)

calls for an alternative to development with knowledge system based on traditional, native culture and localised or at-least a hybrid of native and Western knowledge.

Culture and Development

The socio-economic scenario of a society and its culture are two different phenomenon but they go hand in hand; mutually dependent and affecting each other. Culture of a certain society and community evolves through centuries to be taken as an established-culture; to which the members of the community associate their identity to, and live within the norms and values it sets. The changes in socio-economic condition of a society are inevitable for variety of reasons; like, invention of new technology replacing primitive methods of production, new means of livelihoods, and occurrence of natural and man-made calamities. These inevitable changes in socio-economics of a society implicate change in cultural norms and values community.

The sudden changes in the socio-economic scenario of an area usually have lasting impact on the established social and economic outlooks; like, source of income, roles of male and female in economic activities, and practises and respect of rituals and traditions. According to the definition of culture given by Hofstede (1997), mentioned in literature review below, the social and economic outlook of the society is established over the period of the time by the continually changing cultural norms and values. This makes any society a complex web formed by interweaving of the interdependent and interrelating socio-economic and cultural factors of the outlook of the society. With changes in the socio-economic outlooks consequently the culture; its norms and values, is implicated. The impacts of any developmental intervention on the culture are, therefore, expected to be both positive and negative. But, the negative impacts can be minimised through certain precautions before a project intervenes in any community with set of policies and institutions that are alien to them.

Saidpur village in Islamabad has been converted into a tourist destination by the Musharraf government, in order to provide the exotic culture of the centuries old inhabitants, as a means of attraction for the tourists. The area was connected to Islamabad through well-developed infrastructure, venues in the locality were provided for large restaurants and food chains, and old heritage buildings were renovated and reconstructed.

As a result of the new development, the native culture experienced shocks and so did its value systems. The zenith of commercialisation and tourism had reached the doorstep of the old agrarian community, changing the world that they had known once and for all. This paper is dedicated to find out what the local culture was, and how and in what ways the external factors of tourism has affected it. The paper would also try to find out, if the culture in general and culture of Saidpur in particular is an evolving phenomenon or instead a resistive static thing. The answer to that question would tend to be studied through the adoptability of the traditional natives with the changing socio-economic perspectives.

LITERATURE REVIEW

For the purpose of analysis of data a well-accepted definition of culture given by Hofstede (1997) will be used:

“Culture refers to the cumulative deposit of knowledge, experience, beliefs, values, attitudes, meanings, hierarchies, religion, notions of time, roles, spatial relations, concepts of the universe, and material objects and possessions acquired by a group of people in the course of generations through individual and group striving.”

United Nations Environment Programme outlines the theoretical perspective of socio-cultural impact of tourism as the repercussion on the host communities, through interaction with tourists and being part of tourism industry one way or the other. It is asserted that due to various factors the host communities are weak and prone to any external cultural and societal shock. Hence, with the passage of time changes often occur in community structure, family relationships, collective traditional life styles, ceremonies and morality (UNEP, Retrieved October 12, 2013).

These impacts are not apparent and hence hard to measure, but, in the long run lead to change or loss of indigenous culture and values, due to numerous influences related to tourism. To summarise all the factors is not easy, but the most prominent ones can be stated as; commodification, standardisation, and loss of authenticity of indigenous culture (UNEP, n.d). These dynamics are interrelated yet different but each one stresses upon the imminent structural changes in the culture and tradition.

Commodification refers to the trade of indigenous culture as a tourism commodity, by converting various categories; like, sacred sites and objects, rituals, and festivities into value added goods. Standardisation refers to the provision of certain familiar services and products to tourists hailing from various backgrounds, in order to minimise the sheer unfamiliarity factor. This thrust to meet tourist expectation of an ambiance with balance between familiarity and exoticism, in the long run, make indigenous culture assimilated to foreign influences. Loss of authenticity states the phenomenon of staging of indigenous culture by proving instant glimpse of local culture, atmosphere, norms and lifestyle, to tourist who have little or no knowledge of it.

UNEP on the brighter side conceives tourism as major driver of cultural exchange, means of preservation and transmission, and finally as a force for peace and development. From economic side it can be evaluated as means to growth and development, employment creation, income redistribution and poverty alleviation (UNEP, n.d).

The social and economic impact of tourism in Uzbekistan, by Mirbabayev and Shagazatova, in 2011, is very relevant literature when it comes to study of impact of tourism on local community like, in this case, the Saidpur Village. Their study shows that “tourism, on one hand, can be a source of international amity, peace and understanding and, on the other hand, can be a destroyer and corrupter of indigenous cultures, a source of ecological destruction, an assault of people’s privacy, dignity, and authenticity.” (Mirbabayev, B. and Shagazatova, M., 2011, 25-37)

For positive impact the study gives the anecdote of significant contribution of tourism in preservation of traditional handcrafting, wood carving, hammered copper work, handmade silk and carpets, and of course to preservation and maintenance of architectural and historical monuments, in the remote Uzbek regions; like Samarqand, Bukhara and Horezm (Mirbabayev, B. and Shagazatova, M., 2011, pp. 25-37). After the independence in 1991, renovation and opening up of monuments and museums has promoted culture by attracting foreign people’s interest, on one hand, and hence, has made local people proud of their culture on the other hand (Mirbabayev and Shagazatova 2011, 25-37).

Robinson (1999), as cited in the paper by the authors, stresses on the negative implications of tourism. He says and I quote, “.... [t]ourism can increase tension, hostility, and suspicion. Claims of tourism as a vital force for peace are exaggerated. Indeed there is little evidence that tourism is drawing the world together.” (Mirbabayev. and Shagazatova., 2011).

Mirbabayev and Shagazatova’s impact based study of tourism is of vital importance for study of any tourism based model enterprise in developing world. They stress that tourism is dynamically developing sector and contributing the indigenous communities through inflow of foreign currency, introduction of new managerial and educational practices, and finally through effect on various sector of local economy. Having said that, they do not forget to highlight the power of tourism to affect cultural change; like, dilution or even destruction of culture, overdevelopment, assimilation, conflict, and artificial reconstruction.

RESEARCH QUESTION

The purpose of the study- understanding the impact of tourism, or commercialisation in general, on the indigenous cultural values and norms- was tended to be studied by the following question;

‘How tourism and commercialisation change and redefine ‘cultural norms’ and ‘heritage’, and consequently, how communities adept to those changes?’

METHODOLOGY AND METHODS

The methodology used for this paper is research survey. The methods used to dig out the required information were; informal interviews, researcher’s observation, key informants’ interviews, and very limited level of participant observation. The information gathered, during several trips made to the targeted community, was huge and generalised about almost everywalk of life of the community members. Hence, after pre-testing, questionnaires were devised in such a way that aimed at gathering information highly skewed towards research question and focussed on parameters of analysis described below.

Theoretical perspective on relationship between tourism and its impact on culture, and norms, has been taken into account as an insight discourse on what knowledge the existing literature provides us and how it helps us understand the phenomenon. Other than that, a thorough study of social and economic impact of tourism in Kazakhstan, has been reviewed as case study literature, and in the concluding part, I have tried to assess in the lights of my field findings, if the government had given due consideration to take precautions to minimise the repercussions or not.

Sampling

Through random sampling twelve households were selected for informal interviews and information gathering through observations. Apart from that in-depth interviews and discussion were held with key informant for specific topics, like, background and history of the inhabitants, and also interviews were conducted of four young males as the key informants for certain youth related issues that I came across in the earlier pre-testing part of the survey.

FINDINGS

Once home to *Ghakhar*: Opulent agrarian tribe

The present capital of Islamic Republic of Pakistan, Islamabad, was once known as ‘Saidpur’, owned mainly by the then ruling tribe *Ghakhar*.¹ They have been living in the skirts of Margala hills and vicinity areas for more than three centuries, he further narrated with a sense of pride, and were once opulent agrarian Muslim community. They owned almost all the land of the present Islamabad; from Pak-secretariat in the east to G-10 sector in the West, and from Monal in the North to Satellite town Rawalpindi in the South. He vividly remembers himself, and also remembers his ancestor telling him, that the area was home to almost every seasonal fruits of the hilly climate and had a very high production of crops, like maize and wheat. For centuries, as informations were confirmed by validation from another key informant Abdul Qayum too, the present ‘Saidpur village’ was *Mandi* (market centre) for the exchange of goods, for the farmers and growers in the surrounding villages and towns.

¹ A key informant Raja Khaliq Zaman- a native *Ghakhar* and retired employee of CDA (Capital Development Authority) - told me.

‘Ghakhar’ Culture: Amalgamation of Islamic values and Eastern agrarian traditions

The community was traditional agrarian community with strong social norms and traditions; which evolved through centuries of inhabitation in the region and acquired through practising and following a certain religion. Their culture for centuries, hence, remained untouched, respected mutually without questioning, and served the purpose of giving identity to and acting as social bonding glue for the community. As per the amalgamation of Eastern cultures and Islamic values, women stayed mainly with domestic work at home, with little or no part in the economic activities outside household. With the passage of time, it had been established and perceived as something bad or unethical to take women outside homes unnecessarily, and the best anecdote, that I came to know through a key informant in school at the locality, to support that inference was the zero percent enrollment of girls in the school built by British in the locality for both gender.

Changing scenario

Government of Pakistan, during the era of President Ayub, through CDA brought land from the local owners through dialogues and diplomacy. The land, the sole source of living for the inhabitants, was brought for very small price; all the key informants and respondents now remember it as the then market price. The price for the arable land, as recalled by a key informant², was Rs.105 per canal, and for non-arable land, for example an orchard, was as low as Rs. 65 per canal. The money would have covered or been sufficient for the piece of land, but, the toil done on the land for many centuries to make it productive land, and agricultural skills and knowledge acquired by each single inhabitant through centuries of hard work, and the annual return on that land was never paid. Moreover, he sadly spoke about the quality and vitality of the first land CDA brought from them, and for the price they brought it for. The first land brought from them, he told us, was the present F-6/3 sector, which was a highly productive wheat and maize field, made fertile through hundreds of years of toil and hard work, and surrounded by orchards of various fruits.

² Key Informant Raja Khaliquz Zaman

As a result, the whole community became not only landless agricultural experts, but also turned up unskilled laborers, as their acquired skills drained down in the changing economic scenario. The only thing that they were left with was some amount of money in their pockets, which they did not know what to do with it, as they had always been conditioned to barter's system in their agrarian economy.

Parameters of Analysis: Deconstruction of *Ghakhar's* culture

One of the major issues at the beginning of the survey was to find out, and consequently, familiarise ourselves with what culture and cultural identity means to the locals in Saidpur village. This was important as it was needed to devise parameters accordingly, and streamline our survey towards information related to and supporting their perception of and reservations towards the cultural impact of changing economic scenario over the years. The parameters required for the study were for: What indigenous cultural norms are and have been for locals? What factors make them think that culture has been implicated; both for good and bad? How do they measure the adoptability factor?

One major breakthrough achieved during the initial stage of the survey was to know through questioning and observation that for long time the cultural norms and traditions in Saidpur village have been associated with and centred on the women's role in society and ways of participation in economic endeavors. The reason behind it cannot be simplified and assessed here, it's simply beyond the scope of the paper, and even if tried would be simple generalisation, but it can be associated with the existing relationship between evolution of cultural norms and Asian patriarchal society.

As a result, I tried to find out the changing roles of females in the economic activities especially outside the household, also development of female education in the area and changing attitudes of male members of the community towards the acceptance of these changing patterns. Another factor that was needed to be researched on was the prevalence of the feeling of the loss of identity of indigenous people, with tourism introduced at their door steps and new residents in Saidpur village for capitalising on the new economic prospects.

The prevalence of the aggressive and hostile attitudes of the male members of the community towards outsiders was brought to my notice by the key informants. Moreover,

the frustration symptoms and resentment towards outsider can easily be observed right in the first encounter with natives. The detachment of the natives from their roots of norms and values, and incidence of unnecessary competition for materialism would be used as parameters for analysing changing cultural norms and values.

Analysis: Extinction of old culture and changing values

The prominent common response from almost all respondents, irrespective of age, gender, profession, or level of literacy, I observed was the prevailing belief, and perhaps rightly so, that the old culture was extinct and with it all the norms and values. They do not feel good while admitting it, but, on the brighter side one gets the feeling that they are fine with it and give the impression that it's time to move on and integrate with changing socio-economic scenario. But knowing this does not answer the 'how does tourism and commercialisation change cultural norms and values' part of my research question.

Digging deep on this phenomenon, while keeping in mind the theoretical knowledge on relationship between tourism and impact on cultural values, yielded in highlighting few factors within traditional economy; which are the first to get hit hard by any new economic intervention. These factors with the passage of time act as 'inevitable pressure points' to gradually change and redefine culture, norms, rituals and traditions of a society which has undergone or continuing to undergo developmental interventions.

Changing means of livelihoods

The means of livelihood for the local agrarian society had changed when President Ayub took the decision to shift capital of this country to the areas presently known as Islamabad city, formerly owned by local agriculture tribes. But, the process was hustled when the government of Pakistan, through the funding of French government, took the decision of converting it into a model village; through preservation of ancient habitat, and providing it as museum of history and culture of locals to the tourists. This developmental process was to be completed in three phases, and so far the first phase has been executed due to change of governments and hence the economic priorities. Major restaurant chains of the country were given the chance to capitalise on the opportunity by giving the ultimate Western taste and lifestyle to tourists who are here to see a glimpse of one of the comparatively ancient habitat in the region. With that sheer

wave commercialisation has flourished and, as a spin off, provided indigenous people, mostly illiterate, with jobs and new sources of income.

This has changed the socio-economics of the community once and for all. The traditional agriculture related skills and expertise; acquired through hundreds of years of toils, and once highly appreciated have lost utility and are almost of no use in the new service sector, and hence the priorities of skills, knowledge and trainings of the people have changed. Slowly and steadily, the priorities in terms of selection of skills, profession and inter relations between community members have changed, and have had lasting impact on the established belief systems and morals. For example, the potters in the community, who have been related to the same profession for generations and made good living out of it, are no more related to pottery business. One female members of the potter family, who reluctantly shared her thoughts with us, revealed that all the male members of her family are related to trading Chinese crockery in the nearby markets. Two days in a week they open to public on payment a small underground museum, housing mud statues of important national monuments, like Minar-e-Pakistan, Pakistan railways etc, made by them and their elders, and has been source of earning for the family.

Changing role of females

In the preceding agrarian community females had certain economic and social role, mainly restricted to the domestic, agricultural and handicraft activities. With changing economic scenario, the role of each member of the community, especially female members have implicated. The prevailing roles of the females have either become extinct or lost economic utility in the market. Hence, in order to play their role in bread winning for the family, females have to acquire blue collar jobs in the capital city or elsewhere. Blue collar jobs might have sufficed during the initial stage of transition from agriculture to modern sector, but, acquiring competitive high paying jobs has necessitated education and skill development trainings for females.

One female educated respondent, with a B.A (Bachelor of Arts) and B.Ed (Bachelor of Education) degree and running a tuition centre, shared her view with us, and highlighted the earlier reservations of male elders of families in the community regarding educating females, and sending them out for education and jobs without veils and *naqab*. But, she and a few more females shared with delight that things have changed over the

years and there is an increased level of acceptance of female education and participation in economic activities.

Easily detachment from roots

One of the major concern and reservations of the anthropologists in such interventions is the extinction of long acquired life style of the host community; enclosing wisdom, knowledge and skills for different necessities and problems of the community. One of the major reasons for being prone to detachment is the basic fact that the host communities are usually weak, for variety of reasons, against external factors that are propelling the social behaviour. Commercialisation has brought new economic endeavors for the business community and also for professional job seeking individuals, in the Saidpur village.

With the influx of these outsiders, the natives have been tempted towards the new lifestyles. For example, the old habitat construction and designing, climatically suitable for the hot weather ambience as experimented for generations, have been source of temptation for tourists, is being replaced by the newer design for the mere reason of being affordable and up-to-date. If things continued like this, a respondent shared his reservation, within few decades Saidpur village would be exact replica of any Pakistani urban habitat, having nothing to offer to visitors from the culture of indigenous people.

Fueling aggressive and hostile attitude

In any transition economy, the values and the traditions change so fast that there are number of factors that give fuel to aggressive behaviour and promote hostile attitude, among the otherwise very peaceful and calm people. There are number of factors associated with it, but common ones I came across after interaction are as follow.

One young respondent, who did not want to disclose his name and whereabouts, shared with us the trend of party culture; with loud music and liquor, in the restaurants very near to mosque and houses of the natives. The existing belief system of the community, as he told us, does not allow any disturbance and loud noises near mosques. But the restaurants ownership and management, being outsiders, do not show any regards for the culture and norms of the natives and hence, there happened some serious level of scuffle of natives with a prominent restaurant. As result of that, one senior personnel of law enforcement agency, who apparently had some association with the business, punished involved native persons.

Another factor that has added to the emergence of hostile attitude among the locals is the sudden increase of crime rates in Saidpur village due to drug addicts. Since its inception as tourism hub, there has emerged a huge underground drug market, and with that followed the addicts, finally making it home to them also.

Income inequality

The Saidpur village, once an egalitarian agrarian society with equal economic prospects for all, experiences high income inequality among its residents. Since all the restaurants and other tourism related enterprises belong to the influential political personals, and hence, people with certain political alliance and right social networking are benefitting more than those who don't have those luxuries. The respondents shared views that, the placements in jobs created in tourism, the prospects of setting up small business, and any such income augmenting factor, all depend on how better you are known in influential class of country.

Secondly, there has happened huge encroachment in Saidpur village by outsiders as well as by natives. One key informant told us that every inch of land in the area belongs to CDA, and no resident owns an inch of it. But, every local with right networking is constructing houses in CDA land, and renting them out for making money. These factors have worsened the income level of majority of the natives relative to those who have somehow managed to make money out of the system with immense level of rent seeking and corruption.

Adopting to new culture and perception of tourism as means to economic growth

Saidpur, once owned by *Ghakhar* tribe, is home to community with diverse social, cultural, and ethnic backgrounds. The culture that prevailed once has evolved to a new tapestry of culture; with small bits and flavors from diverse backgrounds. The economic, social and cultural roles of the members of the community, both male and female, have changed. The role of females have changed more than anything else; today in new economic prospect their identity is not associated with domestic role once they used to, but, today provided with right knowledge and skills they can be equal members of the society.

Tourism has been the prominent source of income for many members of the community, by bringing jobs and business avenues at their door step; otherwise they had

to go to very far areas of Islamabad and vicinity for menial blue-collar jobs. Tourism is also taken as means of identity of Saidpur village both nationally and internationally. The residents seem happy about such new prospects. You can see the delight in the faces of parents and sense of achievement in the faces of young educated females, when they talk about how the trend has changed regarding educating females and the level of acceptance that has been achieved among the community members.

The parties and various sorts of functions that involved loud music usually take place in restaurants, used to bother natives initially, but, with the passage of time they have developed a certain level of acceptance for the outsiders. Women do go out for jobs, for getting education, for groceries and many such activities, without much fear. But, all the respondents felt that it is not totally safe to go out alone, and they try to avoid going out unnecessarily.

CONCLUSION

Culture of a community continuously changes and evolves with changing socio-economic conditions, as the theory suggests, and found out to be true with observations from the field. Saidpur village has been the perfect laboratory to analyse the impact of tourism, or any other way of commercialisation, on the cultural norms and values. There are external forces that are usually beyond the control of the native people and with the passage of time, if not given attention to, can change the culture to something totally different and we would be left with nothing from the culture as we know it. The impact are not necessarily negative, there surely are positive aspects associated with it also. The task should be to take necessary steps to avoid any sudden change to the status quo of culture, and all the economic decisions should be taken on moral basis, not merely on profit maximisation for a certain class.

Fennell (1999), as quoted by Mirbabayev and Shagazatova, suggest certain steps to minimise negative impact of tourism on culture, which are; involvement of local people in the industry as employees, incorporation of local small business in the industry, respect for local culture, and making sure that natives do benefit economically too (Mirbabayev and Shagazatova 2011).

In the case of Saidpur village all the precautions suggested by the Fennell (1999) have not been taken into account, or to say least, most of them have not been taken into account. The restaurants belong to the elites and political class of the country, the native skills for handicrafts and pottery is dying out, the natives do not own businesses, the outsiders whether businessmen or tourists think of natives and their culture as a stumbling block towards economic growth.

Saidpur village too faced the consequences of tourism and commercialisation on its culture. The local culture has been changed and the natives live in constant fear of losing identity or being demolished at all. It is really soothing to know that the natives have slowly adapted to the changing socio-economic scenario of the area, but, with precautions of respecting native's culture, the transition process would have been less painful for the indigenous people. As long as the native culture is preserved and the promoted through commodification of handicrafts and other artistry work, Saidpur village will be attractive destination for tourists. It will be benefiting the economic growth and will help in job creations through culture as means to development. If government continues to provide investment avenues for rich business class without regards for native culture, it will result in turning up Saidpur into another identity-less urban economic zone with very high population density, pollution, and crime rate.

RECOMMENDATIONS AND LIMITATIONS OF PAPER

For the readers this paper can be misleading in three ways, and as the writer of this paper, I fully accept them as human errors and shortcomings.

First shortcoming is related to the methodology. The sample space for the study is very small and may not represent the aggregate perceptions and views of community. The research methodology and techniques could have been improved with at least three visits before developing final questionnaires. These issues are all related to time constraints, it is a term paper and that means it had to be executed within very limited time and resources.

The second area for improvement is the analysis part of the paper. The parameters of the analysis developed for this paper can be improved to precisely and thoroughly indicate the changing cultural values and norms. The change in the cultural norms and

traditions are intangible and non-observable entities and it is difficult to quantify them or devise parameters for analysis. It will be very helpful to review literature specifically written on the context of impact of tourism and commercialisation on indigenous culture in regions with same socio-economic background as Saidpur.

Third and final area which requires improvement is the literature review. The CDA version of story is extremely important to incorporate, as among the inhabitants there are groups who applaud CDA's work and others simply blamed it for all the wrong doings. These mixed feelings among the inhabitants are driven by who has or hasn't benefitted economically from this developmental project of CDA. It will not easy to find out the real paper work done by CDA while designing and implementing this project, as the documents are unpublished and hence are not be available online. But, from the literature it is evident that the motives behind project were mere Modernisation and economic growth through creating new investment avenues. One thing that requires further inquiry is if CDA had taken precautionary steps to win the trust of the local people before the intervention or not. Furthermore, it needs to be analysed if the intervention was sensitive towards the indigenous people, and had kept in mind to preserve their culture, while designing the project.

ACRONYMS

B.A: Bachelor of Arts

B.Ed: Bachelor of Education

CDA: Capital Development Authority

GDP: Gross Domestic Product

UNEP: United Nations Environment Programme

GLOSSARY

Ghakhar- Name of a tribe

Mandi- Market Centre

Naqaab- Veil

REFERENCES

- Escobar, A. (1995). *Encountering Development: the Making and Unmaking of the Third World*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Escobar, A. (1997). Anthropology and Development. *International Social Sciences Journal*. 2 (2): 497-515.
- Hofstede, G. H. (1997). *Cultures and Organizations: Software of the Mind*. New York:, McGraw-Hill.
- Islam M. S. (2009). Paradigms of Development and Their Power Dynamics: A Review. *Journal of Sustainable Development*. 2 (2): 25.
- Mirbabayev, B. and Shagzatova, M. (2011) The Economic and Social impact of Tourism. *Global Journal*. 1 (2): 25-37.
- McMichael, Philip. (2000). *Development and Social Change*. London: Pine Forge Press
- Rahnema, M and Bawtree, V (1997). *The Post-Development Reader*. London: Zed Books
- Rostow, Walt W. (1960). *The Stages of Economic Growth: A Non-Communist Manifesto*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
- Sachs, W. (1992). "Development: A Guide to the Ruins". The New Internationalists.
- UNEP. (n.d.). *Resource efficiency and sustainable consumption and production, Socio-cultural Impact*.
<http://www.unep.org/resourceefficiency/Home/Business/SectoralActivities/Tourism/WhyTourism/ImpactsofTourism/SocioCulturalImpacts/tabid/78780/Default.aspx>
- UNEP. (n.d.). *Resource efficiency and sustainable consumption and production, Negative Socio-Cultural Impacts From Tourism*, ,
from <http://www.unep.org/resourceefficiency/Business/SectoralActivities/Tourism/FactsandFiguresaboutTourism/ImpactsofTourism/Socio-CulturalImpacts/NegativeSocio-CulturalImpactsFromTourism/tabid/78781/Default.aspx>
- UNEP. (n.d.). *Resource efficiency and sustainable consumption and production, Tourism and Socio-Cultural Conservation*, ,
<http://www.unep.org/resourceefficiency/Business/SectoralActivities/Tourism/FactsandFiguresaboutTourism/ImpactsofTourism/Socio-CulturalImpacts/TourismandSocio-CulturalConservation/tabid/78782/Default.aspx>