

## Section 4

# Social Sector Development



## **Improving Public Sector Development Programme Allocations In Clientelistic Environment Of Balochistan: A Political Economy Analysis**

**Mir Sadaat Baloch & Nadir Khan**

Successive governments in Balochistan have failed to streamline the Public Sector Development Programme (PSDP) despite repeated directions from the High Court and Supreme Court to plan it in an effective manner. This study discusses how political clientelism is influencing the process of PSDP by diverting scarce resources to create incentives for powerful political actors to keep the public dependent and poor. As a result, it is feeding extreme levels of exploitation and corruption in Balochistan. An analysis of the disbursement of PSDP in the 10 districts in last ten years clearly shows some districts with more population and area have been receiving less funds as compared to less populated and smaller districts. To over this inefficiency this research has formulated a mathematical model that estimates the amount to be allocated to each district, where the amount to be allocated to each district is a function of the total PSDP and the weights of population and area for that district. Then to further prioritise the projects of any department a performance matrix is developed. The matrix ranks the public sector development projects. The criteria used in the matrix are the themes obtained from the interviews and focus group discussions with the personnel of the relevant departments. Finally, this study suggests that a single approach for budgeting would make it difficult for government. The government must use a formulaic approach along with a participatory approach for effective PSDP allocation in the clientelistic environment of Balochistan.

## **Public-Private Partnerships In Education: Evaluating The Education Management Organizations Program In Sindh, Pakistan**

**Gul Muhammad Rinda & Dhani Bux Shah**

The focus of this study was to investigate public-private partnerships (PPPs) in education, in this instance by evaluating the Educational Management Organizations (EMOs) Program in Sindh, Pakistan. The study is guided by the research questions which were intended to evaluate to what extent, how, in what way, and for whom PPP mode of education through EMOs improve access to education, ensure quality and equity in education, and sustainability in the context of Sindh, Pakistan? We have chosen the Realist

Evaluation as a methodological approach, applied New Public Management as a theoretical framework to answer the research questions, and adopted a mixed methods research design. The data collection includes EMOs policy documents, PSLM survey, SEMIS, and SAT data sets. Moreover, we have conducted 37 semi-structured interviews and FGDs with the EMO stakeholders, including policy developers, school operators, managers, headteachers, teachers, and parents. The findings indicate that PPPs through EMOs have some advantages in better governance of schools through autonomy and decentralization. The schools' accountability, monitoring, and evaluation have been somehow improved. However, the broader impact of EMOs reform still does not reflect in increasing access, overall quality, and ensuring equity; also, the sustainability of these schools after EMOs contractual period remained unpredicted. This study may open a window for policymakers and concerned stakeholders to better understand what works, for whom, in what circumstances and design a better regulatory framework of PPPs beyond the piecemeal approach to education reform.

## **An Impact Evaluation Of Government Scholarships On Students Success: A Case Study Of University Of Turbat**

**Riaz Ahmed**

This study tries to investigate the short to medium term impact of government sponsored scholarships on undergrad students' academic performance and other success outcomes. Taking advantage of the recent initiatives of governments at both federal and provincial level for introducing undergrad scholarship programs that provide us a quasi-natural experimental research design, this study utilizes a difference-in-differences (DID) approach to estimate the impact of scholarships on students' academic and success outcomes. Using University of Turbat as a case study, we compare academic performance outcomes — Percentage marks, GPA, or CGPA — of students who held scholarships with academic performance outcomes of those in the same sessions, departments and degree programs without having scholarships before, during and after the awards. Our results show that, the HEC Ehsaas scholarship program—which is designed to support financially the needy students' — seemingly increased the academic performance of male students only with a percentage point of 4.10 in their semesters' marks. This improvement is significant economically because an additional of 4.10 percent marks could secure a student from dropping out at the university's enrolment or change the grade of a student from B to B+. In order to tracing out channels through which this impact could possibly happen, this study tests a number of hypotheses to validate the

findings. These findings indicate that male students when obtained scholarships are less likely to depend on their parental income for the university related expenses than female students. Also, they are more likely to focus in their study by taking class notes seriously in the class compared to their counterpart male students who did not hold scholarships. The positive impact of scholarship on students' others success outcomes (e.g. students' retention, engagement and satisfaction, acquisition of skills and competences, and career success) particularly for male is also validated in a number of t-tests by using our survey data. Surprisingly, this did not find any evidence on the impact of merit based scholarships on students' academic performances.

## **Skill Mapping And Human Resource Planning For Proposed Special Economic Zones: Job Creation For Unemployed Youth Of Pakistan**

**Aziz Ahmed**

The TVET system of Balochistan is highlighted to give starting point mapping of TVET skills for human resource planning in this study. The study reveals that human resource planning through TVET composed of B-TEVTA, skills allied provincial departments, NAVTTC skills sets, the provision of skills by national and international NGOs, and private sector skills provision including apprenticeships in existing industrial set-ups for SEZs/EPZs that ensure job creations for provincial labor force. The strength of skills mapping for human resource planning are based on these institutional frameworks of TVET system in Balochistan. The skills dissemination through public and private sectors institutions rely upon TVET policies, laws, protocols and standards of provincial and national qualification frameworks to ensure quality skills provision for skilling the provincial labor force. The guidelines given by NAVTTC, ILO and UNESCO documents for skills provisions in the province recognize the testing and relevancy of TVET skills mostly concerned with fulfilling the common sets of demand-driven TVET skills for the requirements of industrial labor market needs in the province. The study also reveals deficiencies in the categories of mapped lists of skills for vocational, technical and specific skills sets required for the existing, proposed and potential industries focused in this study. There are traces of legal, administrative, coordination, cascading, not specific to industrial needs, highly imbalanced skills sets provision among vocational and technical skills, gender-biased, quality compromises, non-alliance of provincial TVET provisions, and deficiencies in specific technical and vocational skills are issues that are identified for skills mapping and human resource planning to effectively ensure job creation for unemployed labor force to be employed in SEZs/EPZs of Balochistan. Low skills formations and shortages of technical and vocational skills are deficient areas mapped in this study. To cope with the problem of skills deficiency in technical

and vocational skills for the needs of SEZs/EPZs and their industrial labor demands justify the case for devising human resource planning to ensure employment and job creation for unemployed youth of Balochistan. The policy options are given below for human resource planning pertaining to skills development that could justify the following policy recommendation in the context of the findings and discussions of this study.